

مناظرات قطر
qatardebate

عضو في مؤسسة قطر
Member of Qatar Foundation

Debate

Instructional Resource Materials

Lesson 3: Speaker Roles



Debaters Today, Leaders Tomorrow

Lesson Plan

Part One – Unit 1

Lesson 3: Speaker Roles

Subject

Debate and the skills of debating.

Topic

Speaker roles.

Level

Intended audience Beginners.

Projected Length of the Lesson

Depending on the number of the activities used in the lesson.

Pre-requisites

Lessons 1 and 2.

Description

Debating is a team sport and debaters must work together when preparing their team's case during the debate. This lesson can be used to give insights, ideas and suggestions which may aid in teaching the roles that different speakers assume in a debate. The lesson comprises activities and other materials that deal with different aspects of speaker roles. It is hoped the reader finds this lesson useful in clarifying how each speaker within the team has certain roles to play and how important it is that each speaker understands and fulfils their role.

Goals

The overall goal of this lesson is to enable students to:

- Be familiar with the structure of competitive debate.
- Understand and utilize the basic style and format of debate.
- Begin to interact with the debate.

Objectives

By the end of this lesson, students will:

- Understand and be able to apply the rules and procedures governing competitive debate.
- Learn to play the different roles and responsibilities of different speakers in a debate.
- Learn the basic outline and structure of a debate round.

Key words & phrases

a) Motion: Also known as the topic.

It is an expression of opinion that includes a word such as 'would, should, shall, will, etc.' and always includes an actor (e.g. 'This house ...').

b) Affirmative Team: The side in a debate that supports or "affirms" the motion.

c) Negative Team: The side in a debate that opposes or "negates" the motion.

- d) **Constructive Speech:** The 1st set of speeches in which both sides “construct” their arguments and positions. Constructive speeches are 5 minutes.
- e) **Point of information:** A request to the speaker that holds the floor to yield the floor to a statement or question from a member of the opposing team. This applies when the opposing side is allowed to rebut an argument by standing and waiting to be recognized by speaker.
- f) **Reply speeches:** Reply speeches are offered following the conclusion of the 3rd negative speaker’s speech. They are given by either the 1st or 2nd speaker (never the 3rd) and are 3 minutes long. The negative reply is given first, followed by the affirmative reply.
- g) **Refutation/Rebuttal:** This refers to the response or reaction of debaters to the arguments of the opposing team. Refutation/Rebuttal is one of the most important components of debating. Different speakers should handle rebuttal slightly differently. For example, the rebuttal by a first negative should be brief enough to allow the negative to develop their case fully.

Introduction

The best debating teams consist of skilful debaters who understand their roles and responsibilities very well and are fully aware of the complexities associated with each speaker position. With this understanding, the speakers can appreciate how the roles complement each other and thus put the team in the best position to win. These speaker roles might sound a bit restrictive, but they help the debate run smoothly and clearly so that everyone in the room understands what the debate is about and what each team stands for.

Materials

- Laptop
- Video projector
- Screen
- YouTube
- Writing pads
- Pens/Pencils
- Flipcharts

Procedure

This section describes the different component parts of the present lesson.

1. Preparation (5 minutes)

- a) Prepare a PowerPoint Presentation created to run slide shows that explain the different roles of speakers in a debate.
- b) Have YouTube/short embedded videos ready for use to demonstrate samples of speeches.
- c) Have an LCD projector ready for displaying data on a screen.
- d) Provide notepads, pens, and pencils.

2. Lesson

This part of this lesson includes the different steps followed in the delivery of the 'Speaker roles' lesson.

Activity 1: Lecture and video

The purpose of this activity is to help students to learn to assume the different roles and responsibilities of different speakers in a debate and enable students to apply the rules and procedures governing competitive debate. The instructor may use a PowerPoint presentation to familiarize students with the various roles different speakers play in a debate and the rules and procedures that govern in a debate.

The Power point presentation should have links to sample video clips from recorded debates to exemplify instances where the 1st, 2nd and 3rd speakers play their respective roles and responsibilities.

a) The instructor starts by discussing the main “components/elements of a debate”, i.e.:

- **Problem**

- Why is it a ‘problem’?
- What is the function of a ‘problem’ in a debate? (What does it do?)
- What is the significance of a ‘problem’ in a debate? (How important is it?)
- What are some examples of problems?

- **Solution(s)**

- Why is it a ‘solution’?
- What is the function of a ‘solution’ in a debate? (What does it do?)
- What is the significance of a ‘solution’ in a debate? (How important is it?)
- What are some examples of solutions?

- **Outcome(s)**

- Why is it an ‘outcome’?
- What is the function of an ‘outcome’ in a debate? (What does it do?)
- What is the significance of an ‘outcome’ in a debate? (How important is it?)
- What are some examples of outcomes?

b) The students are encouraged to engage in the discussion.

- c) The instructor then explains how each component/element (i) constitutes an integral part of a debate and (ii) relates to and fits within a debate. Examples need to be provided to illustrate.
- d) The students answer questions that require of them to explain the role expected of different debate speakers with regard to each of the following:
- Identifying the problem – Including a definition of the motion
 - Suggesting a solution(s) – Based on the team's case
 - Identifying the outcome(s) – The goal of the team
- e) An alternative would be to ask the students to indicate which of the four speeches (and speakers) should tackle (i) the problem, (ii) the solution, and (iii) the outcome.
- f) Next, the instructor runs video clips that illustrate different speech portions which exemplify the different roles of speakers (for example, a clip displaying a problem; another presenting a definition, etc.).
- g) By playing a clip at a time, the instructor asks the students to identify:
- What task or responsibility is being performed (for example, defining the topic/ motion, introducing the team's case, etc.).
 - Who performs this task or responsibility (1st, 2nd or 3rd speaker).
- h) Next, the instructor asks the students to identify the speaker(s) whose responsibility is to perform the tasks and responsibilities listed below:
- Defining the topic.
 - Presenting the team case.
 - Outlining briefly what each speaker in the team will talk about.
 - Accepting or rejecting the definition
 - Refuting the main points presented by the opposite team.
 - Reaffirming the team line.
 - Presenting a summary of the team's case.
 - Rounding off the debate.
- i) The students learn to associate each of the roles and responsibilities with the relevant speaker.

Activity 2: Question-Answer Session

This activity can be used to reinforce what is covered in Activity 1 so that students better understand what the role and responsibility of each speaker in a schools competitive debate is and how the speakers can work as a team to prove their case and win the debate. Using a PowerPoint presentation and video clips, the students are exposed to the speaker roles as well as the debate rules and procedures. The presentation has content and in-built video clips that demonstrate the speaker roles and the sequence as well as development of the speeches.

Suggested steps for this activity include:

- a) The instructor runs the PowerPoint presentation slides and stops at different intervals (the end of each speech)
- b) Based on the content and sequence of the PowerPoint presentation, the instructor runs samples of built in video clips from a recorded debate(s).
 - Each video clip should correspond to one speech at a time (for example, the speech of the 1st speaker, 2nd speaker, etc.).
- c) At any point, video clips can be paused and re-wound to facilitate discussion.

As required and following the flow of the PowerPoint presentation, the instructor should allow ample space for discussion. This also depends on how much time is available and the size of the group, too. This may take the form of a Question-and-Answer session where the students are asked questions that revolved around the roles of the speakers. Questions which may instigate the discussion could comprise the following:

- Which of the speakers should provide a definition of the debate motion?
- What are 2, 3 or 4 tasks the 1st (or 2nd/3rd) speaker should perform?
- Who should refute the opposite team's arguments?
- What happens if a speaker does things another speaker is supposed to do?
- Which speaker should re-structure the whole debate?
- Which speaker needs to prove the other team wrong?
- Which speaker needs to declare the reasoning of their team's victory?

Activity 3: Group Work

This exercise is an opportunity for students to have a hand-on experience of assuming speaker roles and actually delivering speeches according to their roles as 1st, 2nd or 3rd speakers; it also allows students to try giving reply speeches. The steps that may be followed in this activity are:

- a) The instructor splits the class into up to 4 groups, depending on class size.
- b) Each group is given one of the following two positions (For or Against the motion); the instructor can choose the topics to focus on):
 - Either For or Against the motion:
“This house would give more power to the executive body.”
 - Either For or Against the motion:
“This house believes that the GCC countries should have their own parliaments.”
 - Either For or Against the motion:
“This house believes that the Arab spring has been a real failure.”
 - Either For or Against the motion:
“This house believes we should have a federal United States of Europe.”
- c) The instructor then allows the student groups time to brainstorm arguments for their position and to form their ideas into between 3 to 6 big points.
- d) The teams should then split these (For or Against) points between the three allotted speakers for their group.
- e) The instructor may wish to choose the speakers and repeat the activity with different topics to allow everyone the chance to be a speaker).

Activity 4: Demonstration Debate

This activity introduces debate to students through demonstration where students watch a video of a debate.

- a) The instructor introduces the video-taped debate by telling the students they will be watching a debate on topic ‘X’ where two opposed teams present their cases, one in favor and the other against.

- b) The instructor explains that he/she will be pausing and re-winding selected portions of the video pertaining to individual speeches in order to facilitate discussion.
- c) As they watch, and to facilitate active observation, the students need to take notes to identify, evaluate, and discuss the different speeches that make up a team's case.
- d) The instructor gives the students directions to look for certain characteristics of individual speeches.
- e) The instructor encourages the students to ask/answer questions that lead them to critical thinking about the decisions that they would make when identifying, evaluating, and discussing the different speeches.
- f) The students ask or answer any questions they may have on the debate.

Activity 5: Model Debate

In this activity students take on a particular role – as 1st, 2nd or 3rd speakers – and perform that specific role from this perspective in a live debate delivered in class. It is strongly recommended that the model debate is tried only after the preceding activities have taken place, especially activities 1–5. The value of this exercise is two-fold:

- It enables the students to practice speaker roles.
 - It also helps to focus the attention of students not immediately involved in the debate.
- a) A topic of interest to students may be chosen by the instructor. Ideally this is a topic they research prior to class; otherwise, the students are given sufficient time to prepare.
 - b) The instructor may have the 6 most skilled and confident students to debate center stage and model proper debate form and style.
 - c) As the 6 debaters sit center-stage, other students observe the action.
 - d) The instructor then assigns roles to different students and explains:
 - The format the debate will follow.
 - The speech times.
 - What the 1st speaker, 2nd speaker and 3rd speaker of each team (Proposition

& Opposition) is expected to do (tasks & responsibilities). Note: No reply speeches are performed in this activity (see Appendix 1).

- e) The students are given 15–20 minutes to prepare their respective speeches.
- f) To actively involve observers, the students may be asked to:
 - Write down the main points introduced by each side as the debate progresses.
 - Take note of any errors committed by the speakers and share them with class.
- g) Students have a go at the actual debate and present their 3–5–minute speeches one after the other.
- h) At the end of each individual speech the instructor gives continuous feedback on how to improve the speech and invites comments from the rest of the class.
- i) The students deliver 3–5–minute speeches again following the feedback they received from the instructor.
- j) The roles may be rotated so the students can try different roles as a 1st, 2nd or 3rd speaker.

N.B. The rigor of this model debate can be enhanced by giving out roles in advance and requiring that the students research the positions they take and prepare formal speeches.

Activity 6: Definitions

This activity highlights the importance of a definition in a debate. Before a debate starts, the motion that is given must first be defined by the Proposition team. A definition clarifies the motion and gives a clear description that limits and focuses what the debate will be about. This prevents the debate from turning into a vague and confusing display of unrelated arguments and different interpretations from both teams of what is actually being debated among them. Out of the definition should come a clear understanding of the issues that will be fought over in the debate.

The instructor explains that defining the debate motion is the role of the 1st speaker from the Proposition team. The 1st Opposition speaker may challenge the opposing team's definition.

- a) The instructor distributes copies of the 'Speaker-roles' sheet and each student gets a copy (Appendix 2).

b) Each student is asked to:

- Think about a word or term of his choosing.
- Write it in clear, bold character on a piece of paper.
- Provide 3 definitions of the word/term such that one definition carries a positive meaning, another is associated with a negative meaning, and the third has a neutral meaning.
- Ask the other students in class if the meaning of that word/term is positive, negative or neutral and explain why.
- As the other students respond, they realize words/terms are perceived and defined differently by different students.

c) The instructor then has the students watch a 1st Proposition speech on video. It is not necessary that the speech is perfect; as a matter of fact, it is better if the speech has a few flaws in it. This way, the students will not feel intimidated and will get a chance to discuss how the speech could have been improved. The video should highlight the following:

- Statement of the motion.
- Definition of any terms that need to be defined.
- Stating the team's case line.
- Indicating what points will be covered.
- Stating what the 2nd and 3rd speakers will cover.
- Delivering the 1st part of the case.

d) As they watch the video, the students need to take notes of how the 1st speaker delivers the points above.

e) The instructor guides the discussion and takes some or all of the points listed under (c), one at a time. For example:

- The students may discuss whether or not all of the points are covered in the speech.
- The instructor may stress the definition must be debatable (i.e. it must have two sides to it).

- The discussion may involve students' opinions of the wording, relevance, and clarity of the motion.
 - The students can examine whether or not the team's case line was stated.
- f) The instructor then runs a short video clip of the speech of the first Opposition speaker's and asks the students to pay attention to the following:
- Does the 1st Opposition speaker agree or disagree with the definition given by the Proposition?
 - Does the speaker state their team's case line?
 - Is there a statement of what the 2nd and 3rd Opposition speakers will talk about?
 - Does the speech contain a rebuttal of what the 1st Proposition speaker said?
 - Did the speaker deliver their part of the case?
- g) As they watch the video, the students need to take notes of how the speaker's delivers the points above.
- h) The instructor guides the discussion and takes some or all of the points listed under (f), one at a time.
- i) The students exchange their responses and the instructor provides feedback.

Activity 7: Debate Practice

Participating in a debate is a good opportunity to prepare for debating and public speaking. Taking part in a debate not only develops students' self-confidence, but also teaches them to think logically, articulate clearly and respond effectively — all of which are effective oral communication skills that are necessary for debating.

- a) To begin this activity, the instructor takes the students through a few preparatory exercises to help them generate and organize their ideas, and also learn the appropriate expressions to use in a debate.
- b) The instructor can follow these steps:
- Choosing a topic that is interesting and that generally lends itself to differing opinions, such as:

- Women are better managers than men
 - Television does more harm than good.
 - The Internet should not be used in schools.
 - Boys and girls should be educated in separate schools.
- Assuming that the class decides on the first topic, the instructor divides the students into groups.
 - The students brainstorm on the qualities of a good manager. For example:
 - Good knowledge of the company's products, targets, clients, developments, etc.
 - Good handling of money matters.
 - Good communication skills.
 - Clear guidance and good organization.
 - Ability to empower and motivate employees.
 - Integrity, etc.
- c) The instructor divides the class into two sections — one to support the motion (that is, women are better managers than men) and the other to challenge and oppose it.
- d) Each section sits together and prepares a list of points that support their views.
- e) When they are ready, each section should nominate three speakers to argue their viewpoint.
- f) When they are ready, the debate can begin, with the instructor as a moderator.
- g) The instructor decides on the modalities of the debate — for example:
- Time allotted to each speaker.
 - Being polite and respectful to speakers in the opposite team.
 - Taking turns to speak and not interrupting, and so on.
- h) If possible, the instructor records the debate, and plays it back later so that the students can comment on it and learn from their experience. The debate

experience may be extended by involving students from other classes, and asking other teachers to join in. This will extend the students' exposure to debates and help them improve their debating and public speaking skills.

Summary & Recap

The instructor may use the summary to recap and reinforce the material that was covered in class and have the students reflect on the lesson. This can also be used to give the students a chance to raise questions they may have on the lesson.

Closure

The instructor gives a brief review of the lesson to remind students what that they have learned in class. This can also be useful in pin-pointing any further practice needed on the topic and checking students' understanding of the topic. It may also be used to check if the students are ready to move on to the next lesson.

Appendix

Appendix 1: Speaker roles (a)

Appendix 2: Speaker roles (b)

Appendix 1: Speaker Roles

This is a brief outline of the speaker roles in the QatarDebate format.

	PROP(OSITION)		OPP(OSITION)
1st PROP (5 minutes)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Defines the topic (explains the problem behind it/ contextualizes the debate) • Identifies the Prop's case • Outlines a solution to the problem • Explains the case division (who will present what arguments) and theme • Presents own arguments • Provides a summary of their speech 	1st OPP (5 minutes)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responds to the solution (i.e. accepts, rejects or clarifies) • Responds to the solution • Gives the case division and theme of their own team • Rebutts the 1st Prop's arguments • Presents own arguments • Provides a summary of their speech
2nd PROP (5 minutes)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rebutts 1st Opp's arguments • Reiterates and defends his first speaker's arguments • Presents their own argument • Provides a summary of their speech 	2nd OPP (5 minutes)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rebutts 2nd Prop's arguments • Reiterates and defends their first speaker's arguments • Presents their own argument • Provides a summary of their speech
3rd PROP (5 minutes)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rebutts substantially • Reiterates and defends their own team's case • Provides a summary of their speech 	3rd OPP (5 minutes)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rebutts substantiall • Reiterates and defends their own team's case • Provides a summary of their speech

- * Teachers should provide students with a copy of this hand-out to facilitate students understanding of the roles expected of each speaker.

Appendix 2: Speaker roles

These points outline the bare bones of each speech. A speaker who covers all these points will have fulfilled the basic requirements of a good debating speech.

• 1st Affirmative

- 1) Define the topic: explain the issue of the debate, briefly describing the argument that each side must present.
- 2) Present affirmative case statement (also known as 'case line' or 'team line'): this should briefly summarize the main argument of the team.
- 3) Present case division: state the arguments to be presented by the first and second speakers (third speakers need not be mentioned, as their role is rebuttal).
- 4) Present arguments: attempt to set out each argument separately and thematically, with the most important coming first. The first speaker may need to introduce a 'model' or a 'test'. (See section 9.1 below for more on models and tests.)
- 5) Summarise: the speaker should briefly summarise the arguments raised in her/his speech, reiterate the arguments that are to be presented by the second speaker and link these to the case statement.

• 1st Negative

- 1) Where necessary, clarify the issue established by the affirmative's definition.
- 2) Present affirmative case statement (also known as 'case line' or 'team line'): this should briefly summarize the main argument of the team.
- 3) Present rebuttal: this should be thematic and address the most important points raised by the first affirmative speaker.
- 4) Present case division: state the arguments to be presented by the first and second speakers (third speakers need not be mentioned, as their role is rebuttal).
- 5) Present arguments: attempt to set out each argument separately and thematically, with the most important coming first. The first speaker may need to introduce a 'counter model'. (See section 9.1 below for more on models.)
- 6) Summarise: the speaker should briefly summarise the arguments raised in her/his speech, reiterate the arguments that are to be presented by the second speaker and link these to the case statement.

• 2nd Affirmative

- 1) Present rebuttal: the speaker rebuts the main points raised by the first negative speaker and respond to criticisms of arguments made by the first affirmative speaker.
- 2) Present arguments.
- 3) Summarise: the speaker should summarise not only the points made in their own speech, but the main points raised by their team as a whole.

• 2nd Negative

- 1) Present rebuttal: the speaker rebuts the main points raised by the first affirmative speaker and respond to criticisms of arguments made by the first negative speaker.
- 2) Present arguments.
- 3) Summarise: the speaker should summarise not only the points made in their own speech, but the main points raised by their team as a whole.

• 3rd Affirmative

- 1) Present rebuttal: thematic rebuttal should address the key issues of the debate, relating the arguments and counter-arguments of the affirmative and negative.
- 2) Summarise: third speakers should allow time for a careful and convincing summary their team's main arguments and the significant issues in the debate.

Note: third speakers are not allowed to introduce any new matter into the debate.

• 3rd Negative

- 1) Present rebuttal: thematic rebuttal should address the key issues of the debate, relating the arguments and counter-arguments of the affirmative and negative.
- 2) Summarise: third speakers should allow time for a careful and convincing summary their team's main arguments and the significant



QatarDebate



@QatarDebate



QatarDebate



QatarDebate



www.qatardebate.org